UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN MILWAUKEE DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

Civil Action No. 2:20-cv-859

v.

KOHL'S DEPARTMENT STORES, INC.,

Defendant.

COMPLAINT FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION, OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF, AND CIVIL PENALTIES

Plaintiff, the United States of America, acting upon notification and authorization to the Attorney General by the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC"), pursuant to Section 16(a)(1) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 56(a)(1), for its Complaint alleges:

1. Plaintiff brings this action under Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and Section 621(a) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act ("FCRA"), 15 U.S.C. § 1681s(a), to obtain injunctive and other equitable relief and monetary civil penalties for Defendant's acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), and in violation of the Section 609(e) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e).

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

2. This Court has subject matter jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1337(a), 1345, and 1355.

3. Venue is proper in this District under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b)(1)-(d) and 1395(a), and 15 U.S.C. § 53(b).

PLAINTIFF

4. This action is brought by the United States of America on behalf of the FTC. The FTC is an independent agency of the United States government given statutory authority and responsibility by, *inter alia*, the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 41-58, and the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1681-1681x. The FTC is charged, *inter alia*, with enforcing Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), which prohibits unfair and deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce, and the FCRA, which imposes duties on businesses that have provided credit, goods, or services to, accepted payment from, or otherwise entered into a transaction with someone who is believed to have fraudulently used another person's identification.

DEFENDANT

5. Defendant Kohl's Department Stores, Inc. ("Kohl's") is a Delaware corporation with its principal place of business at N56 W17000 Ridgewood Drive, Menomonee Falls, Wisconsin 53051. Kohl's transacts or has transacted business in this District and throughout the United States.

COMMERCE

6. At all times material to this Complaint, Defendant has maintained a substantial course of trade in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.

FAIR CREDIT REPORTING ACT

- 7. The FCRA was enacted in 1970, became effective on April 25, 1971, and has been in force since that date. The Fair and Accurate Credit Transactions Act amended the FCRA in December 2003, and the Dodd-Frank Act amended the FCRA in July 2010.
- 8. Section 621 of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681s, authorizes the Commission to use all of its functions and powers under the FTC Act to enforce compliance with the FCRA by all persons subject thereto except to the extent that enforcement specifically is committed to some other governmental agency, irrespective of whether the person is engaged in commerce or meets any other jurisdictional tests set forth by the FTC Act.
- 9. Section 609(e)(1) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e)(1), requires a "business entity" to provide an identity theft "victim" with "application and business transaction records" evidencing any transaction that the victim alleges to be the "result of identity theft." The business entity must provide such records "not later than 30 days after the date of receipt of a request from a victim."
- 10. For purposes of Section 609(e)(1), a "business entity" is an entity that has "provided credit to, provided for consideration products, goods, or services to, accepted payment from, or otherwise entered into a commercial transaction for consideration with, a person who has allegedly made unauthorized use of the means of identification of the victim[.]" 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e)(1).
 - 11. Section 609(e)(11), 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e)(11), defines a "victim" as: a consumer whose means of identification or financial information has been used or transferred (or has been alleged to have been used or transferred) without the

authority of that consumer, with the intent to commit, or to aid or abet, an identity theft or a similar crime.

- 12. To obtain application and business transaction records of the alleged identity theft, the victim must make the request for records in writing and mail it to an address specified by the business entity. 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e)(3). The records must be provided to the victim or, if specified or authorized by the victim, a law enforcement agency.
- 13. Prior to providing the records, a business entity can require that the victim provide:
 - A. proof of his or her identity, such as a copy of the victim's government-issued identification card, 15 U.S.C § 1681g(e)(2)(A); and
 - B. proof of the claim of identity theft, by providing a police report and a completed affidavit, 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e)(2)(B).
- 14. The FTC also has issued guidance on multiple occasions to businesses seeking to comply with FCRA Section 609(e). Each guidance document states that businesses must provide records directly to victims upon request.

DEFENDANT'S BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

- 15. Kohl's is a large national department store chain with a significant online retail presence through the website, www.kohls.com ("Kohl's Website"). Among other things, the company sells clothing, accessories, beauty goods, and home products.
- 16. Prior to February 2017, Kohl's policy for handling requests for application and business transaction records from victims of identity theft, pursuant to Section 609(e) of the

FCRA ("609(e) Requests"), was to provide all such records to the victim within 30 days of the receipt of a request, after proper verification.

- 17. In February 2017, Kohl's changed its policy for responding to 609(e) Requests related to Website orders. Under the new policy ("February 2017 Policy"), Kohl's would only share information identifying the identify thief with law enforcement or with a victim's attorney, upon their direct request.
- 18. In August 2018, Kohl's further revised its policy for responding to 609(e)
 Requests. Under the new policy ("August 2018 Policy"), Kohl's would provide customers with a Kohl's charge account with a more expansive list of business and transaction records (such as statements, receipts, and applications), but Kohl's continued to refuse to provide detailed order information (such as the address and phone number listed on a fraudulent application or the shipping address used for fraudulent orders) directly to any customers. In addition, under the August 2018 Policy, Kohl's would no longer provide such detailed information about fraudulent orders to victims' attorneys. According to this policy, victims had a single recourse for obtaining such information from Kohl's: a request directly from law enforcement.
- 19. As a result of Kohl's February 2017 and August 2018 Policies, many victims of identity theft were unable to obtain application and business transaction records related to the identity theft they suffered. Specifically, Kohl's informed victims that it was not permitted to share such information with anyone other than law enforcement.
- 20. In addition, on several occasions, Kohl's failed to respond to victims—even to issue a denial of their request—within 30 days.

- 21. Victims, who expended significant amounts of time submitting and following up on 609(e) Requests, repeatedly complained to Kohl's about its failure to grant their requests. Several victims also sent Kohl's the language of Section 609(e) of the FCRA as well as copies of the FTC's business guidance about 609(e) Requests in an effort to persuade the company to grant their requests. None of these efforts prompted any change in Kohl's policies, despite the fact that victims experienced (and repeatedly reported to Kohl's) significant frustration as a result of them.
- 22. The August 2018 Policy remained in place until April 2019, when Kohl's finally implemented a policy that required it to provide victims of identity theft with the application and business transaction records they requested.
- 23. Based on the facts and violations of law alleged in this Complaint, Plaintiff has reason to believe that Defendant is violating or is about to violate laws enforced by the Federal Trade Commission because, among other things, Kohl's knowingly engaged in its unlawful acts and practices for more than two years (February 2017 through March 2019), Kohl's continued its unlawful acts or practices despite knowledge of numerous complaints from victims of identity theft, and Kohl's only stopped its unlawful conduct six months after it received a Civil Investigative Demand from the FTC.

VIOLATIONS OF THE FCRA

Count I (Failure to Provide Records)

24. As described in paragraphs 15-22, in numerous instances, Kohl's entered into commercial transactions with persons who made unauthorized use of the means of identification

of victims and failed to provide the required application and business transaction records to victims upon request.

- 25. By and through the acts and practices described in paragraph 24, Kohl's has violated Section 609(e) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e).
- 26. Pursuant to Section 621(a)(1) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681s(a)(1), the acts and practices alleged in paragraph 24 also constitute unfair or deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

Count II (Failure to Respond Within 30 Days)

- 27. As described in paragraphs 15-22, on multiple occasions, Kohl's entered into commercial transactions with persons who made unauthorized use of the means of identification of victims and refused to provide the required application and business transaction records not later than 30 days after the date of receipt of a request from a victim.
- 28. By and through the acts and practices described in paragraph 27, Kohl's has violated Section 609(e) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681g(e).
- 29. Pursuant to Section 621(a)(1) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681s(a)(1), the acts and practices alleged in paragraph 27 also constitute unfair or deceptive acts or practices in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).

CONSUMER INJURY

30. Consumers have suffered and will continue to suffer substantial injury as a result of Defendant's violations of the FCRA and the FTC Act. Absent injunctive relief by this Court, Defendant is likely to continue to injure consumers and harm the public interest.

THIS COURT'S POWER TO GRANT RELIEF

- 31. Section 621(a) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681s(a), and Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), empower this Court to grant injunctive and such other relief as the Court may deem appropriate in the enforcement of the FTC Act and the FCRA. The Court, in the exercise of its equitable jurisdiction, may award ancillary relief, including rescission or reformation of contracts, restitution, the refund of monies paid, and the disgorgement of ill-gotten monies, to prevent and remedy any violation of any provision of law enforced by the FTC.
- 32. Section 621(a)(2)(A) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681s(a)(2)(A), authorizes the Court to award monetary civil penalties in the event of a knowing violation, which constitutes a pattern or practice of violations. Kohl's violations of Section 609(e) of the FCRA, as alleged in this Complaint, were knowing and constituted a pattern or practice of violations. As specified by the Federal Civil Penalty Inflation Adjustment Act of 1990, 28 U.S.C. § 2461(a), as amended, the Court is authorized to award a penalty of not more than \$3,993 per violation for penalties assessed after February 14, 2019.
- 33. Each instance in which Kohl's has failed to comply with the FCRA in one or more of the ways described above constitutes a separate violation of the FCRA for the purpose of assessing monetary civil penalties under Section 621 of the FCRA. Plaintiff seeks monetary civil penalties for every separate violation of the FCRA.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Wherefore, Plaintiff, pursuant to Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b), and Section 621(a) of the FCRA, 15 U.S.C. § 1681s(a), and the Court's own equitable powers, requests that the Court:

- A. Enter judgment against Defendant and in favor of Plaintiff for each law violation alleged in this Complaint;
- B. Enter a permanent injunction to prevent future violations of the FTC Act and the FCRA by Defendant;
- C. Award Plaintiff monetary civil penalties from Defendant for each violation of the FCRA as alleged in this Complaint; and
- D. Award Plaintiff the costs of bringing this action, as well as such other and additional relief as the Court may determine to be just and proper.

Dated: June 8, 2020

FOR THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION:

WHITNEY A. MOORE ELISA JILLSON Attorneys

Federal Trade Commission Division of Privacy and Identity Protection 600 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Mail Stop CC-8232 Washington D.C. 20580 Tel: (202) 326-2645; -3001

FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

JOSEPH H. HUNT Assistant Attorney General Civil Division

ETHAN P. DAVIS
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

GUSTAV W. EYLER Director Consumer Protection Branch

MATTHEW D. KRUEGER United States Attorney Eastern District of Wisconsin

/s/ Speare I. Hodges
Speare I. Hodges
Trial Attorney
Consumer Protection Branch
U.S. Department of Justice

P.O. Box 386 Washington, DC 20044 (202) 532-0295 Speare.I.Hodges@usdoj.gov

Michael A. Carter Assistant United States Attorney Wisconsin Bar No. 1090041 United States Attorney's Office Eastern District of Wisconsin 517 E. Wisconsin Ave., Suite 530 Milwaukee, WI 53211 414-297-4101 Michael A. Carter@usdoj.gov

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

purpose of initiating the civil do	ocket sneet. (SEE INSTRUC	IIONS ON NEXT PAGE C	OF THIS FC	_	,					
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS				DEFENDANTS						
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA				KOHL'S DEPARTMENT STORES, INC.						
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				County of Residence of First Listed Defendant (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED.						
(c) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number)				Attorneys (If Known)	1					
See attachment				See attachment						
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (Place an "X" in G	ne Box Only)	III. C	<u> </u> TIZENSHIP OF P	PRINCIPA	L PARTIES	(Place an "X" in	One Box f	or Plaintij	
✓ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff			Citiz		TF DEF	Incorporated or Pr of Business In T		or Defenda PTF □ 4	<i>unt)</i> DEF □ 4	
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant			Citiz	een of Another State	2				□ 5	
				Citizen or Subject of a 3 3 Foreign Nation 6 6 6 6 Foreign Country						
IV. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an "X" in One Box Only) CONTRACT TORTS				ORFEITURE/PENALTY	_	here for: Nature of NKRUPTCY	of Suit Code Descriptions. OTHER STATUTES			
□ 110 Insurance □ 120 Marine □ 130 Miller Act □ 140 Negotiable Instrument □ 150 Recovery of Overpayment	PERSONAL INJURY 310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product	PERSONAL INJUR 365 Personal Injury - Product Liability 367 Health Care/ Pharmaceutical Personal Injury Product Liability 368 Asbestos Persona Injury Product Liability 368 Asbestos Persona Injury Product Liability 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage Product Liability 385 Property Damage Product Liability 463 Alien Detainee 510 Motions to Vacata Sentence 530 General 535 Death Penalty Other: 540 Mandamus & Oth 550 Civil Rights 555 Prison Condition 560 Civil Detainee - Conditions of	1	25 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 90 Other LABOR 10 Fair Labor Standards Act 20 Labor/Management Relations 40 Railway Labor Act 51 Family and Medical Leave Act 90 Other Labor Litigation 91 Employee Retirement Income Security Act IMMIGRATION 62 Naturalization Application 65 Other Immigration Actions	422 Appe	eal 28 USC 158 drawal USC 157 RTY RIGHTS /rights at at - Abbreviated Drug Application emark .SECURITY (1395ff) k Lung (923) C/DIWW (405(g)) D Title XVI	375 False Cla 376 Qui Tam 3729(a) 400 State Re; 410 Antitrust 430 Banks ar 450 Commer 460 Deportat 470 Racketes Corrupt (aims Act (31 USC) apportions and Banking ce ion er Influenc Organizati er Credit ne Consun on Act at TV ss/Common ge tututory Act ural Acts mental Ma a of Inform on trative Pro ew or App Decision tionality o	ment g ced and ions mer ditties/ tions atters nation cocedure peal of	
	moved from	Appellate Court		pened Anothe (specify		☐ 6 Multidistr Litigation Transfer	1-	Multidis Litigatio Direct Fil	n -	
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION	N Federal Trade Co	ommission Act, 15	U.S.C. §	<i>Do not cite jurisdictional sta</i> § 53(b); Fair Credit F	Reporting A	\ct, 15 U.S.C. \				
THE DECLINATION	Failure to provide	the required appli		nd business transac						
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER RULE 23, F.R.Cv.P.				DEMAND \$ CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: 220,000.00 JURY DEMAND: ☐ Yes ★No			nt:			
VIII. RELATED CASE IF ANY	(See instructions):	JUDGE			DOCKE	ET NUMBER				
DATE 06/08/2020	-1									
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY RECEIPT # AM	^{MOU} Case 2:20-cv-	<u>00</u> 859°LFNett	06/08/	<u>20 P</u> age എഎ് <u>2</u>	2 Docu	ımen ™1 G1⊓UD	OGE			

INSTRUCTIONS FOR ATTORNEYS COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET FORM JS 44

Authority For Civil Cover Sheet

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and service of pleading or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. The attorney filing a case should complete the form as follows:

- **I.(a) Plaintiffs-Defendants.** Enter names (last, first, middle initial) of plaintiff and defendant. If the plaintiff or defendant is a government agency, use only the full name or standard abbreviations. If the plaintiff or defendant is an official within a government agency, identify first the agency and then the official, giving both name and title.
- (b) County of Residence. For each civil case filed, except U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county where the first listed plaintiff resides at the time of filing. In U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county in which the first listed defendant resides at the time of filing. (NOTE: In land condemnation cases, the county of residence of the "defendant" is the location of the tract of land involved.)
- (c) Attorneys. Enter the firm name, address, telephone number, and attorney of record. If there are several attorneys, list them on an attachment, noting in this section "(see attachment)".
- II. Jurisdiction. The basis of jurisdiction is set forth under Rule 8(a), F.R.Cv.P., which requires that jurisdictions be shown in pleadings. Place an "X" in one of the boxes. If there is more than one basis of jurisdiction, precedence is given in the order shown below.
 - United States plaintiff. (1) Jurisdiction based on 28 U.S.C. 1345 and 1348. Suits by agencies and officers of the United States are included here. United States defendant. (2) When the plaintiff is suing the United States, its officers or agencies, place an "X" in this box.
 - Federal question. (3) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1331, where jurisdiction arises under the Constitution of the United States, an amendment to the Constitution, an act of Congress or a treaty of the United States. In cases where the U.S. is a party, the U.S. plaintiff or defendant code takes precedence, and box 1 or 2 should be marked.
 - Diversity of citizenship. (4) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1332, where parties are citizens of different states. When Box 4 is checked, the citizenship of the different parties must be checked. (See Section III below; **NOTE: federal question actions take precedence over diversity cases.**)
- III. Residence (citizenship) of Principal Parties. This section of the JS 44 is to be completed if diversity of citizenship was indicated above. Mark this section for each principal party.
- IV. Nature of Suit. Place an "X" in the appropriate box. If there are multiple nature of suit codes associated with the case, pick the nature of suit code that is most applicable. Click here for: Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.
- V. Origin. Place an "X" in one of the seven boxes.
 - Original Proceedings. (1) Cases which originate in the United States district courts.
 - Removed from State Court. (2) Proceedings initiated in state courts may be removed to the district courts under Title 28 U.S.C., Section 1441. When the petition for removal is granted, check this box.
 - Remanded from Appellate Court. (3) Check this box for cases remanded to the district court for further action. Use the date of remand as the filing date.
 - Reinstated or Reopened. (4) Check this box for cases reinstated or reopened in the district court. Use the reopening date as the filing date. Transferred from Another District. (5) For cases transferred under Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1404(a). Do not use this for within district transfers or multidistrict litigation transfers.
 - Multidistrict Litigation Transfer. (6) Check this box when a multidistrict case is transferred into the district under authority of Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1407
 - Multidistrict Litigation Direct File. (8) Check this box when a multidistrict case is filed in the same district as the Master MDL docket.

 PLEASE NOTE THAT THERE IS NOT AN ORIGIN CODE 7. Origin Code 7 was used for historical records and is no longer relevant due to changes in statue.
- VI. Cause of Action. Report the civil statute directly related to the cause of action and give a brief description of the cause. Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity. Example: U.S. Civil Statute: 47 USC 553 Brief Description: Unauthorized reception of cable service
- VII. Requested in Complaint. Class Action. Place an "X" in this box if you are filing a class action under Rule 23, F.R.Cv.P. Demand. In this space enter the actual dollar amount being demanded or indicate other demand, such as a preliminary injunction. Jury Demand. Check the appropriate box to indicate whether or not a jury is being demanded.
- VIII. Related Cases. This section of the JS 44 is used to reference related pending cases, if any. If there are related pending cases, insert the docket numbers and the corresponding judge names for such cases.

Date and Attorney Signature. Date and sign the civil cover sheet.